

Enterprise and Business Committee

Meeting Venue:

Committee Room 3 – Senedd

Meeting date:

12 March 2014

Meeting time:

09.00

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



For further information please contact:

Siân Phipps

Committee Clerk

029 2089 8582

enterprise.committee@wales.gov.uk

Agenda

Briefing in private (9.00–9.20)

FORMAL PUBLIC MEETING (09.20)

1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

2 Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020 (session 1) (09.20–09.50) (Pages 1 – 22)

Witness:

Prof. Russell Deacon, Lecturer in History and Politics, Coleg Gwent

Attached Documents:

Private paper (Members' Brief for Items 2–5)

EBC(4)–07–14 p.1)– Evidence from Prof. Russell Deacon

3 Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020 (session 2) (09.50–10.40) (Pages 23 – 31)

Witnesses:

Sharron Lusher, Principal, Pembrokeshire College

Dr Greg Walker, Deputy Chief Executive, ColegauCymru

Sharon Thomas, Executive Director, ECTARC

Jessica Blair, Policy Analyst, Institute of Welsh Affairs

Attached Documents:

EBC(4)–07–14 p.2) – Evidence from ECTARC

EBC(4)–07–14 p.3) – Evidence from ColegauCymru

BREAK (10.40–10.55)

4 Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020 (session 3) (10.55–11.25) (Pages 32 – 34)

Witnesses:

Simon Stewart, Senior Lecturer, Glyndwr University and Connect Cymru Committee Member

Helen Wales, Director, UNA Exchange

Attached Documents:

EBC(4)–07–14 p.4) – Evidence from Connect Cymru

5 Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020 (session 4) (11.25–12.10)

Witnesses:

Filippo Compagni, European Policy and External Funding Manager, European and External Funding Unit, Powys County Council

Barbara Burchell, Principal European Project Development Officer, Community Development Service, Conwy County Borough Council

Helen Morgan, Senior Manager, West Wales European Centre, Carmarthenshire County Council

6 **Papers to note** (Pages 35 – 39)

Attached Documents:

Minutes of Previous Meeting

EBC(4)-07-14 p.(5) – Supplementary evidence

De-brief in private (12.10–12.30)

Agenda Item 2

This paper has been deemed not suitable for publication in line with the Commission's rules for conduct of business.

Document is Restricted

[National Assembly for Wales](#)

[Enterprise and Business Committee](#)

[Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020](#)

Evidence from Prof Russell Deacon – EUO 18

Submission by Professor Russell Deacon to Committee Enquiry on EU funding 2014–2020

Although I am chair of the European Movement in Wales I am writing my comments with respect to the Committee's request for information in respect of my academic experience with the ERASMUS programme.

In many European countries, such as Germany in professions, such as teaching and business a period of study abroad is mandatory. In Wales less than one in hundred undergraduate students take part in the same study abroad period. This is not only a lost opportunity it is also frequently putting Welsh graduates at an economic disadvantage in an increasingly globalised world.

I worked for almost twenty years on the ERASMUS programme, mainly at Cardiff Metropolitan University but also visiting and studying the operation of the ERASMUS programme in universities across Europe. I was the only academic, I ever came across that was aware of the full processes of ERASMUS who also actually taught the students directly. Normally ERASMUS is separated between administrative functions and teaching. Having a substantial academic and practical knowledge of the ERASMUS programme and its practical aspects did not prove, however, to be of any real interest to academic institutions in Wales. For instance:

1. Cardiff Metropolitan University made me redundant and I believe have not operated the programme I was involved in to anywhere near the same extent.

2. Swansea University, with whom I worked for, for a year, also were not interested in using the experience and knowledge I had gained.
3. In addition, the British Council who administer the scheme had no interest in my experience, despite a number of efforts to speak to them on this.

The central reason for this lack of interest may well be that ERASMUS is seen as a loss maker and none of the substantial socio-economic and networking opportunities of ERASMUS are understood or even considered as a plus point.

In my last two years at Cardiff Metropolitan University I undertook substantial research on the benefits of the ERASMUS programme not only for Welsh students but also the positive and negative impact of incoming students to Welsh university degree programmes. I was able to discover the root causes of why UK students, outside of language programmes, failed to take up ERASMUS places. The research I undertook was able to identify the key factors in Welsh students failing to take up ERASMUS study abroad programmes. The research findings for Welsh students also indicate that unless you are on a languages course in a pre-1992 institution you are almost certainly never going to study for a period abroad using ERASMUS. I cite from my published work in 2011:

Of the post-1992 Welsh institutions, only three participate in the programme (UWIC, Glamorgan and Newport). The scale of the lack of participation of post-1992 Welsh institutions in ERASMUS is staggering. Here only one in every 1381 full time students takes part in the ERASMUS programme. Thus a student at a pre-1992 institution is 17 times more likely to take up ERASMUS than one in post-1992 institutions. When these figures are viewed on a geographical basis they illustrate the huge divide between neighbouring institutions. Students at Cardiff University, for instance, are more than 20 times more likely to go on an ERASMUS study period than students at UWIC, although both institutions are in the same city

These figures may be even worse than this now.

I was also able to ascertain the substantial benefits to Wales from incoming ERASMUS students. Most of which are never made use to Wales' own economic and educational detriment. Sadly this research was never published because of my redundancy. I firmly believe that with the right joined up thinking the ERASMUS programme could be adapted to Wales' economic benefit to the potential of tens of millions of pounds in exports and inward investment. It could also substantial increase the learning experience of students studying in Wales by effectively internationalising the curriculum and drawing on this substantial international resource.

Although nearly always a rewarding opportunity for those who go on an ERASMUS study period it has remained of a wasted opportunity for Wales in respect of gaining substantial economic and educational returns, which other nations have readily gained.

My published research can be found at:

http://educationstudies.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2013/11/russell_final_2.pdf

Prof Russell Deacon

[National Assembly for Wales](#)

[Enterprise and Business Committee](#)

[Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020](#)

Evidence from The European Centre for Training and Regional Co-operation (ETARC) – EUO 02

ECTARC's involvement in LLP and Europe Direct from 2003 – 2014

We have been involved in the LLP (Life-long learning programme) since 1988, formerly Petra, then Leonardo. Since 2003 we have sent approximately 100 participants per year from Wales with funding from the EU Leonardo programme which we have successfully bid for each year and the Welsh Government have provided the co-funding to cover ECTARC's administration/marketing and participants preparation costs of £100,000.00 per annum. The programme involves a thirteen week period abroad, three weeks of language tuition followed by a 10 placement in a field of work connected to their studies in Spain, Italy France or Germany. We recruit, select and send a cohort of participants in January, April, June and September and manage the programme from inception to completion. We recently undertook a tracking survey with ex-participants to ask some detailed information on Where are you now? Did Leonardo contribute to your current employment etc., with some interesting results. We have also carried out a number of case studies which have provided invaluable information for ourselves and the funding bodies. (copy attached)

Three years ago Leighton Andrews, Education Minister visited ECTARC and was most impressed with the work that we are doing and the commitment by the employer engagement and beneficiaries to this project. He mentioned the fact that under the WG current spending review it was going to be difficult to continually co-fund this project and that ECTARC should be looking to be part of a bigger initiative like the HEFCW GO Wales programme. I would agree that the project fits very well into a Graduate work placement international programme, which is designed to support the deployment development and retention of graduates high level skills, knowledge and innovative potential in businesses in Wales. We believe it is particularly important to the economic, social and cultural development of Wales that individuals here in Wales have the opportunity to access this programme. We consider that the benefits are very clear in terms of personal and language development and employability. GO Wales already has at its core a long standing and well respected placement programme, and ECTARC could provide the international dimension to the programme. The EU Life-long learning programme is an important means of strengthening and improving the offer for graduates in Wales, further enhancing their employability and improving their skills sets in line with employers' expectations.

A meeting took place between a Welsh Government official, HEFCW and ECTARC to discuss the potential and it was agreed that HEFCW would draw up a contract to support the

programme for one year initially with domestic funding of 100K, providing ECTARC were successful in drawing down the EU funding in May, 2011. The funding was confirmed by ECORYS the National Agency in November 2011 and ECTARC was also awarded a Mobility Certificate (one of only five in the UK). A contract was awarded by HEFCW to ECTARC to cover the co-funding element of the project for a period of three years.

It is interesting to note that for the 120 funded places per year we have approximately 350 applications per year.

Welsh partners.

Our partners in Wales, include all the HE's, the Erasmus Coordinators, or Heads of Language Depts., and Careers Wales; GO Wales Co-ordinators, HEFCW. The PDA Team (City and Guilds Professional Development Award) Swansea University.

International partners

We have established partners with the Generalitat de Catalunya, ONECO Seville, Spain G.E.B. Berlin, Albeit und Leben Hamburg, Germany, INSUP Bordeaux, AEF Academia di Firenze, Florence.

500 Europe Direct Centres across Europe.

The total amount of funding received from the EU Life-long Learning programme from 2003- 2014:

£2,800,969.29

The total amount of co-funding received from WG/HEFCW:

£981,280.54

which has enabled almost under 1000 recent graduates from Wales or studying in Wales to benefit from a 13 week language and work experience programme in either Spain, France Italy and Germany.

Other European Funding

We were granted a contract to host a Europe Direct Centre in 2007 - 2014.

We have received **£192,446.66** in funding from the EU

And co-funding of **£135,456.00** from local authority contributions

Future We intend to make an application for the new Erasmus + programme in March, under KA1 Mobility for 120 Individuals in the HE sector including recent graduates. It is our intention to apply for a Mobility Placement Consortium with other HE institutions, focussing on STEM and Entrepreneurship graduates. Co-funding for the project is currently being

explored, (as the WG have decided at a meeting in December with HEFCW that they had no more co-funding available for ECTARC) without this element it will be impossible to run the project as the funding in the Erasmus + programme is far less than the LLP programme.

The sustainability of the project is only possible with co-funding from another source.

A copy of our latest newsletter and tracking survey attached.

Sharon Thomas
Executive Director
ECTARC – The European Centre for Training and Regional Co-operation
Parade Street
Llangollen
Denbighshire
North Wales LL20 8RB
www.ectarc.com

21 January, 2014



Inquiry into EU Funding Opportunities 2014-2020

January 2014

Colegau Cymru
Uned 7 Cae Gwyrdd
Greenmeadow Springs
Tongwynlais, Caerdydd CF15 7AB
Ff: 029 2052 2500
E: hello@colegaucymru.ac.uk
W: www.colegaucymru.ac.uk

Colleges Wales
Unit 7 Cae Gwyrdd
Greenmeadow Springs
Tongwynlais, Cardiff CF15 7AB
T: 029 2052 2500
E: hello@collegeswales.ac.uk
W: www.collegeswales.ac.uk

Introduction

1. ColegauCymru welcomes the opportunity to respond to the Enterprise and Business Committee's inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014-2020. ColegauCymru represents the 15¹ further education (FE) colleges and FE institutions in Wales.² In 2011/12, there were 214,850 individual students attending college and 229,615 enrolments.³
2. Colleges have been engaged in maximising the benefits Wales gains from EU funding programmes for two decades. Colleges have participated in a range of programmes designed to promote the upskilling of the labour force in Wales and to reduce social exclusion. This is part of colleges' core business to promote Wales's economic revival through an enhanced skills base and through the transfer of innovation and technology to business and industry.
3. Wales' position on the western periphery of the EU has enabled it to participate in some of the constituent programmes of INTERREG in its previous phases. The opportunity to participate in the 2014-2020 period in INTERREG V, the Ireland-Wales Cross Border programme, the Atlantic Area programme and the North West Europe Transnational programme presents a further chance for Wales to benefit from these important programmes.
4. ColegauCymru itself has taken a leadership role in helping colleges to engage with these programmes, particularly the EU lifelong learning programmes such as Leonardo (and from 2014 Erasmus+). Our ambition is that colleges will significantly extend their engagement with these programmes in the 2014-2020 programming period. We have begun to work with colleges and other agencies across the UK to plan potential collaborative projects under INTERREG.
5. To this end, colleges in Wales and ColegauCymru played an important role in the high level Celtic Nations EU Funding Seminar with representation from Ireland, Northern Ireland and Scotland, which took place in Dundalk in Ireland on 29th and 30th January 2014. The seminar explored options for working together on cross-border projects relating to the INTERREG programmes. Follow up work from that seminar will feed into colleges' own plans to engage with these important EU funding programmes in the 2014-2020 programming period.
6. ColegauCymru would welcome the opportunity to give further evidence to the committee in person. We are happy for this response to be placed in the public domain.

¹ The 15 include 10 FE corporations including St David's Catholic College; the two FE institutions - WEA Cymru and YMCA Community College; and The College Merthyr Tydfil, Coleg Sir Gâr and Coleg Ceredigion which are part of university groupings.

² In this paper the terms 'FE college' and 'college' are used to cover FE colleges and FE institutions.

³ *Further Education, Work-Based Learning and Community Learning in Wales 2011/12 SDR 48/2013*, Welsh Government (March 2013).

Responses to questions from the Committee

a). Colleges' engagement in EU Lifelong Learning & INTERREG programme

7. Colleges have engaged extensively with EU Lifelong Learning and the INTERREG programme. Since 2011, **41 EU lifelong learning projects** (including those organised by ColegauCymru) at 11 colleges in Wales have been funded, **gaining a total project income of £2.3m.**
8. To provide strategic assistance to colleges in Wales, ColegauCymru employed an International Coordinator in November 2010 to encourage participation of Vocational Education and Training learners and staff in European funded projects. The main focus was/is to submit a centralised **Leonardo da Vinci** application on behalf of the FE colleges in Wales for apprentice and full time vocational learner mobility with participants undertaking 2-3 week work placements in Europe.
9. ColegauCymru submits a centralised bid for funding on behalf of the FE colleges in Wales on an annual basis and works with a variety of European partners to make the bid a success. Some European partners are sourced from ColegauCymru's network of European links and others are partners with whom the colleges have previously worked but apply for funding via the ColegauCymru application.
10. ColegauCymru has established long term contacts since November 2010 with the mobility departments in the regional government of Catalunya and with the International Director of Tknika in the Basque Country, Spain (funded by the Basque Government). Some of the FE colleges in Wales have established strong relationships with vocational colleges in these areas through ColegauCymru's mobility project – Coleg y Cymoedd (IES Don Bosco, Basque Country and EHTB, Barcelona); NPTC Group (IES La Garrotxa, Catalunya).

Colleges have engaged in the **Ireland-Wales 2007-2013 Programme** and are working hard to make the most of the 2014-2020 programmes. In the Ireland-Wales programme three projects are worth highlighting:

- The **mCommunity** project led by Pembrokeshire College (£1.8m) which focusses on delivering learning through mobile technology to hard- to-reach groups and those most at risk of not engaging in education, training or employment. Outcomes from the project have been notably positive.
- The **Vision** project led by Grŵp Llandrillio Menai (£1m) with the Institute of Technology Tallaght in Dublin, works to provide direct and practical assistance to businesses in moving a product or service design concept

forward from the initial idea stage through to market. The project sees eligible local businesses and entrepreneurs receiving up to a maximum of £30,000 worth of expert support.

- The **Rising Tide** project is a partnership involving Pembrokeshire College and other partners (£2.1m), which delivers vocational training programmes to provide progression routes for marginalised members of the community. The project also delivers community regeneration programmes to develop local events, activities and projects with local stakeholders in the development of maritime tourism and the promotion of local enterprise.

b). The degree of support available to facilitate successful participation

11. Ecorys, the national agency for Leonardo funding up until 2013, is a reliable source of support for mobility applications. Under the 2007–2013 Lifelong Learning Programme, Ecorys managed the Wales Advisory Group which met three times a year. Statistics referring to Wales' participation in all strands of the Lifelong Learning Programme was reported and discussed at the group. The group consisted of organisations that accessed, or had the potential to access, 2013 Lifelong Learning Programme funding as well as representation from Welsh Government which regularly updated the group on its policies and priority areas. It is intended that this group will continue its coordination role under the Erasmus+ programme.

c). Challenges to successful participation (incl. funding/resourcing)

12. Leonardo da Vinci funding has enabled participants to undertake fully funded work placements in Europe. Travel, subsistence and language preparation have all been funded through the grant that has been obtained from Leonardo da Vinci. It appears (confirmation from Ecorys is still being sought) that subsistence rates for 2014-2020 under the Erasmus+ programme may be lower than the 2007–2013 rates. The management fee has also been reduced and there is no funding available for language and cultural preparation of the participants. Thus, whilst there has been an increase in the overall budget for Erasmus+, it appears that funding rates within the different programmes have decreased. These changes could affect participation levels.
13. The higher intervention rates available for INTERREG and some of its related programmes (c.75%) mean that project sponsors are more able to get a potentially beneficial project off the ground. The multinational nature of the collaborations can sometimes be a challenge to organise and sustain logistically, but these challenges have generally not turned out to be insurmountable.

d). Benefits/Value gained from engagement in EU initiatives

14. European funding enables learners from a wide range of socio-economic backgrounds to participate in enriching opportunities overseas. ColegauCymru has primarily focused on opportunities for vocational and work based learners to undertake short periods of work experience with commercial organisations in Europe through Leonardo da Vinci funding.
15. **Benefits to Wales have included:** improvement of technical skills and language skills for students, enhancement of 'soft skills' (teamworking, problem solving, resilience, flexibility, understanding and tolerance of other work and social cultures), recognition of the learning that has taken place during the work placement in Europe through the Europass initiative and through the promotion of the principles of the European Credit System for Vocational Education and Training (ECVET).

e). Opportunities for the 2014-2020 programming period

16. ColegauCymru will continue to submit an application for work placement mobility through Erasmus+ for vocational learners and apprentices on an annual basis and will also continue its support for colleges wishing to submit their own applications for funding. ColegauCymru will also submit an application in 2014 for staff mobility. The destination country is Finland and the target group of staff are responsible for improving teaching and learning within colleges in Wales and who participate in the ColegauCymru Teaching and Learning Network. We are working to ensure that this project will yield benefits for learners in Wales and in our partner regions.
17. Discussions are also underway with the Director of Bilingualism at ColegauCymru and the Director of Sgiliaith (an agency funded to develop Welsh language vocational skills) to organise staff mobility to either the Basque Country or Catalunya for the colleges' Bilingual Champions to explore different approaches to bilingual teaching and learning.

f). Potential help from Welsh Government and other agencies

18. The ColegauCymru International Coordinator's role was initially funded by the Welsh Government for 12 months (November 2010 – October 2011) and the International Coordinator's work was monitored regularly by Welsh Government officials. The International Coordinator role since November 2011 has been funded by ColegauCymru and the job responsibilities are wider than the initial Welsh Government remit.
19. ColegauCymru works with Welsh Government officials on European funding, with officials constructively participating in the sector's European Funding Managers' Network and other fora.

Annex: Leonardo da Vinci funding through ColegauCymru since Nov 2010

Application date	Number of colleges	Number of participants	Number of apprentices	Number of IVET	Number of curriculum areas	Number of European countries	Number of host partners in Europe	Amount of funding (Euro)
February 2011	8	28	28	0	5	3	8	92,000
February 2012	11	63	45	22	8	8	18	215, 996.75
February 2013	7	47	18	29	10	5	18	154, 870.40
TOTAL FUNDING TO DATE (EUROS)								462, 867.15
March 2014 - expressions of interest received from FE colleges but not submitted yet	10	160	tbc	tbc	14	14	30+	250,000+ (estimated figure)

Agenda Item 4

[National Assembly for Wales](#)

[Enterprise and Business Committee](#)

[Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020](#)

Evidence from Connect Cymru – EUO 09

Dear Sir or Madam

RE: Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014-2020

The Connect Cymru Committee would like to provide this brief letter to inform you of our role in supporting applicants from the youth work sector in Wales to undertake projects under the Youth in Action programme and the current Erasmus+ programme.

History Of Connect Cymru

Connect Cymru was created in 1994 through a service level agreement between the Wales Youth Agency and the UK National Agency for the Youth for Europe Programme. Since this date the Connect Cymru Committee have been committed to promoting international youth work opportunities, supporting applicants and training youth workers to benefit young people within Wales. Connect Cymru are the Information Provider in Wales for the 'Youth' strand the Erasmus+ programme. This role is undertaken through a memorandum of understanding with British Council.

Youth in Action Funding in Wales

Since 2007 the Youth in Action programme in Wales has been awarded in excess of 3.5 million euros which has made a unique contribution to the development of young people in Wales.

In 2012 youth groups in Wales received 698,433 euros representing 7% of the overall budget whilst in 2013 this figure was 988,390 euros. These significant amounts reflect the confidence of youth and community sector professionals that experience gained through Youth in Action is recognised as a valuable part of their overall development.

Wales could do more

Connect Cymru are in a strategic position and have the expertise to lead the growth of International youth work in Wales and the associated benefits of diversity advantage such intercultural activities will bring to both communities and organisations in Wales

In 2013 Connect Cymru was provided with a grant for £12,500 from Welsh Governments 'International Education Programme' in order to promote the Youth in

Action Programme, support applicants from Wales and provide training for these applicants.

As a committee we feel that the amount of funding brought into Wales could have been significantly greater had the initial investment been greater. This small amount of additional funding has the potential to build the capacity of youth organisations to attract much more funding from Europe with the potential to replace some of the funds currently being stripped out of Youth Services in Wales.

The Youth strand of Erasmus + will receive a 70% increase in funds for 2014-2020 compared to the previous programme. The opportunity exists to significantly increase the amount of funding Wales receives from this fund. If Wales were to be better organised so that a small amount of core funding could be used to help, what has up until now been a voluntary effort, then the drawn down to Wales could well exceed 2 million euros for the sector at a time of uncertainty and reduced budgets.

Throughout 2014 we aim to continue our work but also promote this success story as sadly many politicians are unaware of this indirect contribution to youth work in Wales. We are proud that in 2013 this £12500 generated almost 1 million euros of youth in action project funding for Wales though frustrated that this wasn't more.

Further information on International youth work

International youth work makes a significant and valuable contribution to young people within Wales.

International youth work approaches use participative and empowering methods, with the fundamental principle of its work with individuals and groups arising from mutual agreement between workers and young people. It does this by providing experiential learning opportunities for young people using a range of creative, challenging and fun activities such as, for example, sport, community aid projects, dance, theatre, visual arts, outdoor activities and music. International youth work also involves young people in a process of 'informal learning' through association with friends and adult youth workers, experiencing and making sense of new situations, different countries, ways of living, food, culture and values. This will often involve young people who have very limited experiences and may not have travelled outside their immediate community.

International youth work is an educational process and the learning arises from the youth worker seeing or creating learning opportunities in the everyday situations young people experience. If the main objective of youth work is to provide opportunities for young people to shape their own futures, then young people must be actively involved in the process, creators of the learning, not merely consumers, working together with youth workers to identify, plan, engage in and reflect upon what they do. It is a process that is recognised and well valued within the Youth in Action programme.

Connect Cymru would actively contribute to this discussion further if requested to do so.

Regards

On behalf of CONNECT CYMRU

Grant Poiner (grant@bgcwales.org.uk) 02920 575705

Simon Stewart s.stewart@glyndwr.ac.uk

Tina Simmons t.simmons@valeofglamorgan.gov.uk

Enterprise and Business Committee

Meeting Venue: **Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

Meeting date: **Thursday, 6 March 2014**

Meeting time: **10.32 – 11.45**

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



This meeting can be viewed on Senedd TV at:

http://www.senedd.tv/archiveplayer.js?v=en_400000_06_03_2014&t=0&l=en

Concise Minutes:

Assembly Members:

William Graham (Chair)
Keith Davies
Rhun ap Iorwerth
Julie James
Eluned Parrott
Joyce Watson

Witnesses:

Committee Staff:

Siân Phipps (Clerk)
Claire Morris (Second Clerk)
Olga Lewis (Deputy Clerk)

TRANSCRIPT

View the [meeting transcript](#).

1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

1.1 Apologies were received from David Rees AM, Byron Davies AM, Dafydd Elis-Thomas AM and Mick Antoniw AM. There were no substitutions.

2 Inquiry into the Welsh Government's approach to the promotion of trade and inward investment – SME interviews (video) (10.30–10.55)

2.1 As part of the Inquiry into the Welsh Government's approach to the promotion of trade and inward investment the Committee watched the filmed interviews with the SME entrepreneurs.

3 Papers to note

3.1 The Committee noted the following supporting documents:

4 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the following business: discussion on the filmed interviews with the SME entrepreneurs and consideration of the Scoping Paper for the STEM follow-up Inquiry (10.55)

5 Discussion on the filmed interviews with the SME entrepreneurs (10.55–11.20)

5.1 The Committee considered this Item in private.

6 Scoping paper for the Follow-up inquiry into Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) skills (11.20–11.45)

6.1 The Committee considered this Item in private.

6.2 The Committee approved the Terms of Reference for the follow-up Inquiry into the Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) skills.

7 Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020 – engagement event with Cardiff University and Cardiff Metropolitan University (the event will take place at Cardiff Metropolitan University, Cyncoed Campus) (12.30–14.30)

7.1 As part of its Inquiry into EU funding opportunities 2014–2020 the Committee participated in an engagement event with Cardiff University and Cardiff Metropolitan University (the event took place at Cardiff Metropolitan University, Cyncoed Campus).

Edwina Hart MBE CStJ AC / AM
Y Gweinidog Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Trafnidiaeth
Minister for Economy, Science and Transport



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

William Graham AM
Chair, Enterprise and Business Committee

5th March 2014

Dear William

I refer to the Committee's request for additional information following the scrutiny session on 19 February.

2012-13 Transport Budget

When additional funding became available in 2012-13, within the former Local Government and Communities Department, budgets were reallocated to progress Transport priorities and address in year pressures. This included further funding of £5.1m to carry out weather related repair works to maintain the safety of the motorway and trunk road network in line with our statutory duties; additional expenditure of £2.8m to accelerate a number of sustainable travel projects to support walking and cycling and local highways and the re-profiling of £6.3m spend to deliver strategic capital transport programmes.

Business Support Considerations

As part of the financial approval process and assessing the return on investment, each application for business support is considered by the Department's Investment panel. All offers of support over

£1m are considered by the external Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board.

Each application for support needs to demonstrate how the project represents value for money, and is appraised using a range of criteria including an assessment of the amount of support versus the average salaries of project jobs and the wider economic benefits of supporting a particular project, taking into account, such areas as nature of job and project location. The cost per job (CPJ) is only one measure when considering support for business.

Overall the average CPJ is indicative only and will vary depending on the programme of support and when the jobs are delivered. In 2012-13 the CPJ for Repayable Business Finance was around £13,400 compared with around £2,500 for the Start Up scheme supporting entrepreneurs. Other key business support programmes include the Wales Economic Growth Fund with an average CPJ of £9,100 and the Tourism Investment Support Scheme of £9,700.

Efficiency Savings

Efficiency savings of £400k were achieved following the successful negotiation of a reduced daily rate for external consultancy advice on technical support for the Superfast Cymru project, and by eliminating the costs of an external Superfast Cymru project manager and managing activity within Welsh Government.

Programme for Government Updates

I will be pleased to include the additional information on transport indicators when providing my six monthly updates for Programme for Government and performance. As part of the annual update for economy and science an overview of expenditure and performance will be provided at action level. However, as outlined in the evidence paper, there is not a direct correlation between expenditure in year and the outputs due to timing differences. In particular large strategic projects deliver jobs and investment over a number of years.

